A 220-nucleotide deletion of the intronic enhancer reveals an epigenetic hierarchy in immunoglobulin heavy chain locus activation

Tirtha Chakraborty, Thomas Perlot, Ramesh Subrahmanyan, Anant Jani, Peter H. Goff, Yu Zhang, Irina Ivanova, Frederick W. Alt, and Ranjan Sen

Activation of a tissue-specific locus involves multiple epigenetic changes that are brought about by cis-regulatory sequences. However, the order or regulation of these changes is poorly understood for any mammalian gene. The ß-globin gene cluster is one of the best characterized in terms of epigenetic regulation. In this locus, a region encompassing the four ß-like genes is in a DNase I–sensitive configuration and associated with acetylated histones H3 and H4 in the erythroid lineage (1, 2). A cluster of DNase I hypersensitive sites (HS) comprise a locus control region that is essential for high-level transcription but not for erythroid-specific histone hyperacetylation or DNase I sensitivity (3–5). These observations provide evidence that transcription activation may be uncoupled from chromatin structural alterations that accompany locus activation.

The mouse Ig heavy chain (IgH) gene locus comprises variable (VH), diversity (DH), and joining (JH) gene segments and constant region exons that are dispersed over 2 Mb on chromosome 12. VH genes occupy ~1.5 Mb and are separated by a gap of 100 kb from 8–12 DH gene segments (6). Most DH gene segments are part of a tandem repeat (7, 8), and the 3’-most segment, DQ52, is positioned less than 1 kb 5’ of the JH cluster. Functional IgH genes are assembled by site-specific recombination between VH, DH, and JH segments to create a V(D)J exon that encodes the antigen-binding variable domain of IgH. V(D)J recombination is developmentally regulated so that DH to JH recombination occurs first, followed by VH to DJH recombination.

Tissue specificity and developmental timing of V(D)J recombination has been conceptualized in terms of the accessibility hypothesis, which posits that recombinase access is restricted to the appropriate antigen-receptor locus depending on the cell type (9). Recent studies implicate histone acetylation as an epigenetic mark of accessible loci (9, 10). At the IgH locus, this is reflected in only the DH-Cµ region being associated with acetylated histones before initiation of recombination.

This article is distributed under the terms of an Attribution–Noncommercial–Share Alike–No Mirror Sites license for the first six months after the publication date (see http://www.jem.org/misc/terms.shtml). After six months it is available under a Creative Commons License (Attribution–Noncommercial–Share Alike 3.0 Unported license, as described at http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/).
rearrangements (11–14). V_{H} genes are hyperacetylated at a later developmental stage coincident with the second rearrangement step (11, 15). Thus, the pattern of histone acetylation closely parallels developmental regulation of IgH gene rearrangements.

Locus accessibility is established by cis-regulatory sequences that were originally identified as transcriptional promoters and enhancers. The D_{H}-C_{H} region contains two tissue-specific DNase I HS in the germline configuration (11). One marks the intron enhancer E_{\mu} (16) (Fig. 1) and the other marks a region 5’ to DQ52 that has promoter and enhancer activity (17). Genetic deletion of the DQ52 HS has little effect on IgH recombination (18, 19), whereas E_{\mu} deletion reduces D_{H} to J_{H} recombination and blocks V_{H} to D_{\mu} recombination (18, 20, 21). Although additional HSs have been identified in other parts of the IgH locus (22, 23), those that have been examined by genetic deletion appear not to contribute to V(D)J recombination.

E_{\mu} transcriptional activity has been localized to a 700-bp region of the J_{H}-C_{H} intron, the bulk of which maps to a 220-bp “core” region that contains all the functionally characterized binding sites for transcription factors (16). The core is flanked by matrix attachment regions, whose deletion does not affect IgH gene recombination (21).

As a step toward understanding how E_{\mu} regulates IgH locus activation, we analyzed the effects of deleting the E_{\mu} core on IgH chromatin structure, transcription, and recombination. For simplicity, we shall refer to this core deletion as E_{\mu} deletion throughout this paper. Of the several histone modifications that characterize a fully active locus, we found that a subset were affected by E_{\mu}, whereas others, such as H3K9 dimethylation or H3K4 methylation, were not. E_{\mu} deletion also resulted in reduced transcription and transcription-associated histone modifications, as well as loss of the DQ52 HS. We suggest that E_{\mu} allelic variants are trapped in a partially activated state that has not been previously described for any mammalian gene. Based on these observations, we propose that a hierarchy of epigenetic changes activate the IgH locus.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Contribution of E_{\mu} to histone modifications

We used core E_{\mu}–deleted mice bred to a recombination activation gene (RAG) 2–deficient background (20) to study the chromatin and transcription state of the IgH locus just before initiation of recombination. We used chromatin immunoprecipitation to assay histone modification changes in the absence of E_{\mu}. In primary B cell precursors that contain unarranged IgH loci (pro–B cells), H3K9 acetylation (H3K9ac), a mark of gene activation, was severely reduced throughout the D_{H}-C_{H} domain on E_{\mu}–alleles compared with E_{\mu}–alleles (Fig. 1 A). This included particularly high levels of H3K9ac at the J_{H} gene segments and the peak located close to DFL16.1, which is more than 50 kb 5’ of E_{\mu}. Because the H3K9ac pattern in an Abelson virus–transformed pro–B cell line from E_{\mu}–/RAG2– mice (Fig. S1 A) was indistinguishable from that seen in primary cells, we extended the analysis to H4 acetylation (H4ac) in this cell line. H4ac levels were also substantially reduced in the absence of E_{\mu} (Fig. S1 B). In contrast, a third activation-specific modification, dimethylation of histone H3 at lysine 4 (H3K4me2), was considerably less affected on E_{\mu}– alleles from bone marrow–derived pro–B cells (Fig. 1 B). We conclude that E_{\mu} controls only a subset of tissue-specific positive histone modifications that mark the unarranged IgH locus.

Dimethylation of lysine 9 of histone H3 (H3K9me2) is a mark of inactive chromatin. In pro–T cells, or nonlymphoid lineage cells, H3K9me2 is present throughout the IgH locus. In pro–B cells, H3K9me2 is replaced by H3K9ac in all parts of the D_{H}-C_{H} region except the intervening DSP2 gene segments (7). We therefore investigated whether E_{\mu}– alleles reverted to H3K9me2 modification in the absence of H3K9ac. The pattern of H3K9me2 was indistinguishable between E_{\mu} or E_{\mu}– pro–B cells (Fig. 1 C), revealing a discordance in the inverse relationship between H3K9ac and H3K9me2. We infer that loss of H3K9me2 is E_{\mu}– independent and gain of H3K9ac is E_{\mu}– dependent in primary pro–B cells. These observations indicate that E_{\mu}– allelic variants are in a partially activated state.

This idea was further corroborated by analysis of suppressive histone modifications in pro–B cell lines. We found that DQ52, J_{H}2, and J_{H}4 amplicons that were associated with particularly high H3K9ac in E_{\mu}– cells contained 2–3-fold higher levels of H3K9me2 in E_{\mu}– cells (Fig. 1 D). We note, however, that the locus was not restored to the fully repressed state seen in pro–T cells (Fig. 1 C) or to the level of H3K9me2 at the adjacent DSP2 repeats in E_{\mu}– pro–B cells. Dimethylation of lysine 27 of H3 (H3K27me2), another negative regulatory mark which has been proposed to be the most evident in dividing cells (24), was also greatly elevated in the DQ52–C_{H} region on E_{\mu}– alleles (Fig. S2). These observations emphasize the state of the E_{\mu}–deleted locus as a transitional intermediate between a fully “open” and a fully “closed” configuration.

Contribution of E_{\mu} to DNase I sensitivity

We further investigated the effects of E_{\mu} deletion using a PCR–based DNase I sensitivity assay to probe E_{\mu}– and E_{\mu}– alleles in pro–B cell lines. To compare between samples, signals from IgH locus amplicons were normalized to an amplicon in E_{\mu}+ cells (Fig. S1 A). This included particularly high levels of H3K9ac in E_{\mu}+ cells (Fig. 1 B). Classical DNase I hypersensitive site mapping by Southern blots confirmed this conclusion (unpublished data). Notably, DQ52 hypersensitivity was also substantially reduced in E_{\mu}– cells, suggesting that it was E_{\mu}– dependent. Loss of E_{\mu}– also reduced DNase I sensitivity within J_{H} gene segments and at C_{H} but not at DFL16.1. The H3K9me2-bearing DSP genes remained DNase I insensitive in E_{\mu}– or E_{\mu}– cells. We conclude that E_{\mu} controls local chromatin accessibility and is critical for generation of the DQ52 HS.
sites are generated independently. In contrast, deletion of individual HSs in BAC transgenics that carry the human locus substantially reduces the formation of other HSs (27). Loss of DQ52 HS on Eμ-deleted alleles resembles the latter observation in a germline rather than transgenic context.

Contribution of Eμ to sterile transcription
We used quantitative RT-PCR with primers as indicated (Fig. 3, top line) to assay transcription in the absence of Eμ. Consistent with earlier results (18, 20), Cμ-encompassing transcripts were reduced ~7–10-fold in Eμ-deficient primary pro–B cells. Because the DQ52 HS is Eμ-dependent, Eμ-deleted alleles lack both known DNase I HSs in the germline D1μ-Cμ region. The partially activated state of the locus that we observed may be the result of cryptic transcription factor binding sites that are revealed in the absence of Eμ. A more interesting implication is that initial locus opening (scored as H3K9 demethylation and H3K4 methylation) is mediated by cis sequences that are not marked by DNase I HS. Codependency of DNase I HS has been previously explored in the β-globin locus control region. In the mouse locus, loss of one HS does not affect formation of the others (3, 26); that is, these sites are generated independently. In contrast, deletion of individual HSs in BAC transgenics that carry the human locus substantially reduces the formation of other HSs (27). Loss of DQ52 HS on Eμ-deleted alleles resembles the latter observation in a germline rather than transgenic context.

Figure 1. Eμ-dependent histone modifications in the unrearranged IgH locus. (A and B) CD19+ bone marrow pro–B cells from RAG2− and Eμ−RAG2− mice were used in chromatin immunoprecipitation (ChIP) assays using anti-H3K9Ac (A) or anti-H3K4me2 (B) antibodies. A typical experiment used cells pooled from six to eight mice of each genotype. Positions of amplicons are indicated in the schematic on the top line; numbers in parentheses indicate position in kb 5′ (−) or 3′ (+) of the nearest Dμ gene segment. Amplicons from Cμ3 and β-actin served as negative and positive controls, respectively. Results shown are from three independent cell preparations and immunoprecipitates analyzed in duplicates. Error bars represent standard deviation between experiments. (C and D) H3K9me2 was assayed by ChIP using primary pro–B and pro–T cells (C) or Abelson mouse leukemia virus-transformed pro–B cell lines from RAG2− and Eμ−RAG2− mice (D). Primary pro–B cells were CD19+ bone marrow cells from RAG2− or Eμ−RAG2− mice and primary pro–T cells were CD4−CD8− thymocytes obtained from the same animals. Anti-H3K9me2 antibody was used to coprecipitate genomic DNA from the four cell types followed by quantitative PCR and analysis as described for A and B. Cell lines were obtained by transforming bone marrow cells from mice of each genotype with Abelson virus. Immunoprecipitation and analysis was performed as described for primary cells. The error bars represent the standard deviation between three experiments.
pro–B cells. Additionally, sense–oriented transcripts, as assayed by the DQ52 amplicon, as well as all antisense transcripts assayed by all other Dμ-amplicons (7, 8), were reduced 10–50-fold in Eμ− pro–B cells (Fig. 3 A). Reduced trans-

Figure 2. DNase I sensitivity analysis of Eμ+ and Eμ− IgH alleles. Nuclei from Abelson virus–transformed cell lines of the genotypes indicated below were treated with increasing concentrations of DNase I (x axis, DNase I U) followed by purification of genomic DNA. Primer pairs from the Dμ-Cμ region (shown in the schematic on the top line), the Cγ3 region, the β-globin, and β2-microglobulin (β2m) loci were used in quantitative PCR amplification of equal amounts of genomic DNA. The proportion of DNA for each amplicon (y axis) at each DNase I concentration was normalized to the level of β-globin amplicon at that DNase I concentration, as described in Materials and methods. The resulting value at 0 U DNase I is assigned the value 1 on the y axis. In this method of analysis, the value for the inactive β-globin gene remains at 1 through all concentrations of DNase I used (not depicted). Increased DNase I sensitivity is reflected in loss of signal with increasing DNase I digestion. To score for the Eμ hypersensitive site, we used primer sets located just 5′ (Eμ-5′) and 3′ (Eμ-3′) to the core region that is deleted in Eμ− alleles. Results are shown for three independent DNase I digestion experiments with Eμ− RAG2− cells (dashed lines) and two independent preparations from Eμ+ RAG2− cells (solid lines). Each amplicon was analyzed in duplicate and each experiment is denoted by a different color.

We conclude that one function of Eμ is to recruit RNA Pol II to the IgH locus.
We also assayed the effect of Eμ deletion on transcription-associated histone modifications. H3K4me3 has been shown to be enriched at the 5’ ends and H3K36me3 at the 3’ ends of transcription units (28, 29). Eμ deletion reduced H3K4me3 levels to a third of that seen on Eμ+ alleles in primary pro-B cells (Fig. 3 C) and virtually eliminated both forms of modifications in the Eμ− pro-B cell line (Fig. S3). We infer that low-level transcription in primary cells may be sufficient to induce H3K4me3; alternatively, this mark may build up as a result of its slow removal by histone demethylases. A plant...
Figure 4. Analysis of D_{H} to J_{H} recombination in Eμ− cells. (A) Abelson virus–transformed Eμ−RAG2− cell lines (6312, lanes 1–4; Eμ+, lanes 13–16) and an Eμ−RAG2− cell line (lanes 7–10) were infected with control (G) or RAG2-expressing (R) retroviruses. Genomic DNA prepared after 6, 9, and 12 d was used to analyze DFL16.1 and DSP2 rearrangements as described in Materials and methods. Location of D_{H}–specific 5′ primers and the common 3′ primer are shown as arrows on the top line. The infection efficiency of the RAG2 virus was 10–15% in 6312 cells as determined by GFP fluorescence. This number could not be determined for Eμ− or Eμ+ cells because all cells were GFP+ before infection. The level of introduced RAG2 in each cell line was determined by PCR amplification of genomic DNA (labeled RAG2). Reactions in lanes 6 and 12 were performed with genomic DNA from total bone marrow cells from a C57BL/6 mouse, and those in lanes 5 and 11 were performed with water to serve as positive and negative control, respectively. An amplicon from the β-globin gene was used to ensure equal DNA usage from all samples. After PCR amplification, the products were fractionated by agarose gel electrophoresis and the products assayed by Southern blotting. Data shown is representative of three independent infection experiments. (B) Signals from control retrovirus-infected day-12 (G12) samples and RAG2 retrovirus-infected day-6 (R6) samples from 6312, Eμ−RAG2−, and Eμ+RAG2− cell lines were quantitated by phosphorimager. Signal intensities from 6312 cells (6312 R6) were taken as 100% and compared with all other samples. Data shown is the mean of three independent infection of each cell line, analyzed in duplicate by PCR and Southern blotting. Error bars represent the standard deviation between experiments.
homeodomain (PHD) in RAG2, which selectively binds H3K4me3, was recently shown to be required for efficient V(DJ) recombination (30, 31). Our observations provide the first evidence that low levels of H3K4me3 present in Eμ-deficient primary pro–B cells may be sufficient to direct D_{H} to J_{H} recombination even in the absence of histone acetylation.

Because Eμ deletion affects V_{H} to DJ_{H} recombination, we examined sterile V_{H} gene transcription in Eμ+ and Eμ− primary pro–B cells. By quantitative RT-PCR, we found that sterile transcripts of proximal V_{H} genes were substantially attenuated by loss of Eμ. (Fig. 3 D); however, five amplicons representing upstream V_{H} genes were not significantly affected. For reference, V_{H}7183.1b (also known as V_{H}81X) is located ~98 kb from DFL16.1 and Vox-1, a further 300 kb from V_{H}7183.1b. VGK2, the most 3′ gene in our set which is not affected by Eμ deletion, lies 420 kb 5′ of Vox-1. We conclude that Eμ influences transcription of gene segments located >400 kb away.

**Effect of Eμ deletion on D_{H} to J_{H} recombination**

Earlier studies show that Eμ deletion results in five- to eightfold lower levels of D_{H} to J_{H} recombination (18, 20). These numbers were obtained from analyses of steady-state cell populations that are potentially subject to selection in vivo. To get an independent measure of D_{H} recombination efficiency, we expressed RAG2 in two Eμ+ and one Eμ− RAG2-deficient pro–B cell lines by retroviral gene transfer and followed the levels of DJ_{H} recombination as a function of time. We amplified genomic DNA from infected cells with 5′ primers corresponding to either DFL16.1 or DSP gene segments and a common 3′ primer downstream of J_{H}3 (Fig. 4, top line). The amplified fragments were detected by Southern blotting after agarose gel fractionation. We observed easily detectable levels of DFL16-J_{H} and DSP-J_{H} rearrangements over the experimental time course in both Eμ+ cell lines (Fig. 4 A, lanes 1–4 and 13–16) but not in the Eμ− cell line (Fig. 4 A, lanes 7–10). Transduced RAG2 gene levels were comparable between all three cell lines, and an amplicon from the β-globin locus was used to ensure equal loading of genomic DNA. The mean of three independent infections is quantitated in Fig. 4 B. We conclude that Eμ deletion severely impairs D_{H} to J_{H} recombination in this assay. The greater reduction of D_{H} to J_{H} recombination in cell lines compared with primary cells may be because the chromatin structure of the IgH locus in continuously cycling Eμ− cells is skewed toward a suppressive state. This is reflected in lower levels of activating modifications H3K4me2 and H3K4me3 and higher levels of inactivating modifications H3K9me2 and H3K27me2 in these cells compared with primary cells. Alternatively, DJ_{H} junctions seen in the bone marrow of Eμ− deficient mice represent a gradual accumulation of recombinant alleles.

Our observations suggest an epigenetic hierarchy in the activation of the IgH locus. We propose that an Eμ-independent first step removes H3K9me2 and establishes the H3K4me2 mark (Fig. 5, line 2). This may permit transcription factors to access Eμ to convert a partially activated state to a fully activated one by Eμ-dependent induction of DNase I HS, histone acetylation, and transcription (Fig. 5 line 4). Though we cannot exclude the possibility that Eμ-independent and Eμ-dependent steps occur in parallel, we favor a sequential model based on studies in Saccharomyces cerevisiae demonstrating that histone acetylation is required for transcription (32). The coordinate control of acetylation and transcription in the IgH locus is in line with genome-wide association studies (28, 33). Because histone acetylation likely precedes transcription (34), we suggest that Eμ binding proteins recruit RNA Pol II and chromatin-modifying enzymes.
to generate the optimal substrate for transcription (Fig. 5, line 3). Subsequently, transcription-associated histone modifications, such as H3K4me3, are incorporated into the locus (Fig. 5, line 4), which, in the case of antigen receptor genes, may be particularly important in targeting the V(D)J recombinease via the PHD domain in RAG2.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Cells. Abelson-transformed RAG2−/− and Eµ−/−RAG2−/− bone marrow–derived cell lines were cultured as previously described (7). CD19− bone marrow cells were purified from RAG2−/− and Eµ−/−RAG2−/− mice were purified as previously described (11). Thymus from the same animals yielded CD4−CD8− thymocytes. All mouse experiments were approved by the Animal Care and Use Committees of the National Institute on Aging (Harvard University and the Immune Disease Institute).

ChIPs. ChIPs were performed as previously described (7). Formaldehyde–cross-linked and sonicated chromatin from 10⁷ cells was preclarified with 5 µg of nonspecific IgG and immunoprecipitated with the requisite antibody (sources noted in Table S1) or an equal amount of nonspecific IgG. The co-precipitated DNA was purified and analyzed by real-time PCR using either previously described primers (7) or primers shown in Table S2.

Real-time PCR and ChIP data analysis. Real-time PCR was performed as previously described (7) using the ABI Prism 7000 (Applied Biosystems). Abundance of target sequences in the immunoprecipitate relative to the input DNA (IN) was determined as previously described (35), where the relative abundance of the target sequence in the immunoprecipitate is 2^{Δ[Ct(IN)]}, and Ct is the cycle at which the sample reached a threshold value where PCR amplification was exponential.

DNase I sensitivity. 20 × 10⁶ nuclei from RAG2−/− and Eµ−/−RAG2−/− cells were treated with varying concentrations of DNase I. 25 ng of purified genomic DNA was used in quantitative PCR assays performed in duplicate.

Lentiviral transduction. Lentiviral particles expressing RAG2 were generated as previously described (31) by transiently transfecting 293T cells with pWPI-RAG2 along with helper plasmids pΔ8.2R and pSVG using FuGENE 6 (Roche). The supernatant containing the virus was collected at 48 and 72 h after transfection and concentrated by ultracentrifugation for 2 h at 25,000 rpm and 20°C over a 20% sucrose cushion. 4–6 × 10⁶ cells were infected with freshly prepared control or RAG2-expressing lentivirus by spin inoculation in the presence of 10 µg/ml polybrene. Genomic DNA isolated from RAG2−/−/− bone marrow–derived cell lines was used to normalize across samples, and level of RAG2 was ascertained using a primer pair that amplified part of the RAG2 gene not present in RAG2−/− cells (30 rounds of PCR amplification and 20% of the reaction used for Southern blotting).

Online supplemental material. Supplemental figures show the effects of Eµ deletion on histone modifications assayed in Abelson mouse leukemia virus–transformed cell lines derived from the bone marrow of Eµ−/− mice in a RAG2−/− background. Table S1 lists the sources of antibodies and reagents used for ChIP and Table S2 lists primer sequences used in this work. Online supplemental material is available at http://www.jem.org/cgi/content/full/jem.20081621/DC1.

We thank Sebastian Fugmann, Cosmas Giallourakis, Yu Neel Lee, and Lei Wang for discussion and comments on the manuscript and Valerie Martin for editorial assistance.

D.J. is supported by a Boehringer Ingelheim Fonds PhD scholarship. F.W. Alt is an investigator of the Howard Hughes Medical Institute. This work was supported by National Institutes of Health grant AI20470 (to F.W. Alt) and by the Intramural Research Program of the National Institute on Aging (Baltimore, MD). The authors have no conflicting financial interests.

Submitted: 24 July 2008
Accepted: 2 April 2009

REFERENCES


