A Quantitative Analysis of Antigen-presenting Cell Function: Activated B Cells Stimulate Naive CD4 T Cells but Are Inferior to Dendritic Cells in Providing Costimulation

By Delanie J. Cassell and Ronald H. Schwartz

From the Laboratory of Cellular and Molecular Immunology, National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases, National Institutes of Health, Bethesda, Maryland 20892

Summary

Ligation of CD28 on CD4 Th1 clones and freshly isolated mixtures of naive and memory CD4 T cells triggered their T cell receptors (TCR) is sufficient to induce the costimulatory signals necessary for interleukin 2 (IL-2) production by these cells. CTLA-4-reactive ligands expressed on antigen-presenting cells (APC) are critical in providing costimulatory signals to these T cell populations. We demonstrate that these activation characteristics apply equally to purified naive CD4 T cells. Because B cell blasts express CTLA-4-reactive ligands and high levels of adhesion and major histocompatibility complex class II molecules, they would be expected to engage both the TCR and CD28 and consequently stimulate IL-2 production by naive CD4 T cells. Using purified populations of cells in limiting dilution cultures, we have carried out a quantitative analysis of the interaction between naive CD4 T cells and either activated B or dendritic cells. We demonstrate that B cell blasts stimulate a high frequency of naive CD4 T cells. Slight differences in TCR signaling efficiency between the two APC types were observed. Even at optimal peptide concentrations, however, the amount of IL-2 made by individual T cells was fourfold lower in response to B cell blasts than to dendritic cells. This relative deficiency of activated B cells was due to their inability to optimally costimulate naive CD4 T cells.

The principal aim of this work was to examine the ability of various APC types to stimulate IL-2 secretion by naive CD4 T cells, with particular focus on activated B cells. Activated B cells can clearly stimulate many T cell hybridomas and clones, and freshly isolated populations of CD4 T cells from unprimed animals, which typically include both naive and memory T cells (1-3). In contrast, the question of whether activated B cells stimulate naive CD4 T cells remains controversial. Antigen-specific B cells are remarkably efficient at concentrating and processing antigen (4). Moreover, the specificity of B cells can influence the array of peptides generated during antigen processing (5-7). These characteristics have been suggested to allow B cells to increase the repertoire of T cell specificities observed during an immune response, a phenomenon called diversification or determinant spreading (8, 9). A potential consequence of this is that as B cells become activated during an immune response, B cells specific for an epitope shared between foreign and self antigen could process the self protein and present novel T cell determinants that have not been involved in intrathymic negative selection. Were activated B cells able to stimulate naive T cells, this would pose the risk of autoimmunity (10). To counter this, it has been proposed that primed B cells tolerize naive T cells. Were activated B cells tolerogenic, this could render peptide-carrier conjugates ineffective as T cell vaccines for individuals who already have carrier-primed B cells (11). Thus, the issue of whether activated B cells are stimulatory or tolerogenic for naive T cells is of both theoretical and practical concern.

Previous studies (12-17) have demonstrated a role for B cells in primary T cell responses in vivo. It is not clear in most of these studies, however, whether B cells directly present antigen to T cells or whether their involvement depends only on their production of antibody. Activated B cells have also been reported to stimulate naive T cells in vitro (18, 19). Because of the questionable reliability of the CD45RB isoform as a marker for naive T cells (20) and the large numbers of T cells and APCs used in these studies, it is difficult to be certain that the observed responses were due to interactions between naive T cells and activated B cells and not to contaminating memory T cells or non-B APCs. In contrast to these studies, there are two recent reports that activated B cells fail to prime (21) and instead tolerize naive T cells (22). The T cell populations directly examined in these studies, however, did not include peripheral CD4 T cells and may reflect distinct activation requirements of other T cell subsets. Thus, the issue of activated B cells as APCs for naive CD4 T cells remains unresolved and prompted the current study.
Materials and Methods

Animals. B10.A and CBA/J mice were purchased from Charles River Laboratories (Wilmington, MA) through a contract with the National Cancer Institute, National Institutes of Health (NCI NIH, Frederick, MD) and used between 2 and 6 mo of age. H-2<sup>b</sup>, pigeon cytochrome c (pcc)-specific and TCR-α/β transgenic mice were derived by mating a (C57BL/6 × SJL)F<sub>1</sub> transgenic mouse (provided by Dr. S. Hedrick, University of California at San Diego, La Jolla, CA) to B10.A mice, then backcrossing transgenic mice with normal B10.A or C57BL/10 animals. Mice between the fifth and ninth backcross to the C57BL/10 background were used at 8-12 wk of age. These animals were housed in a barrier colony after embryo transfer at the fifth backcross generation.

Culture Media and Reagents. Lymphoid suspensions were made in a standard balanced salt solution containing 5% FCS (Biofluids, Inc., Rockville, MD) and 100 μg/ml DNase (Sigma Chemical Co.). Cell culture was carried out at 37°C, 5% CO<sub>2</sub> in Eagle’s Hank’s amino acid medium supplemented with 10% FCS, 2 mM glutamine, 100 U/ml penicillin, 100 μg/ml streptomycin, 25 μg/ml gentamicin (BioWhittaker Inc., Walkersville, MD), 50 μM 2-ME (Sigma Chemical Co.), and an additional 1 mM sodium pyruvate, and 1X nonessential amino acids (Biofluids, Inc.). Mouse rIL-2 and GM-CSF were purchased from Pharmingen (San Diego, CA). Purified J11d.2 (cr heat stable antigen [HSA]) (Pharmingen) and ammonium sulfate (Mallinckrodt Specialty Chemicals Co., Paris, KY)-concentrated supernatants of the following mAb-producing hybridomas were used for cell depletions: 3-1.5.5 (αCD8), J10-1 (αThy-1.2), 10-2.16 (αIL-4), Y-17 (αI-E), 33D1 (antispleen dendritic cells) (American Type Culture Collection, Rockville, MD), LCR.LAU.RL172.4 (αCD4), and SW3A4 (αNK1.1, kindly provided by Dr. V. Kumar, University of Texas Southwestern Medical Center, Dallas, TX). Expression of class II and adhesion molecules were determined by staining with FITC-conjugated mAb to I-E<sub>α</sub>, intercellular adhesion molecule 1 (ICAM-1), and LFA-1 (Pharmingen). CTLA4<sub>141</sub>g refers to a fusion protein consisting of the extracellular portion of either mouse or human CTLA-4 spliced onto the CH2 and CH3 domains of human IgG1. mCTLA4<sub>141</sub>g and hCTLA4<sub>141</sub>g, generously provided by Dr. P. Linsley (Bristol-Myers Squibb Pharmaceutical Research Institute, Seattle, WA), were used in this study with identical results. 37.51 hybridoma cells secreting αCD28 mAb were the kind gift of Dr. J. Allison (University of California, Berkeley, CA). GL1 (αB7-2) mAb was generously provided by K. Hatchock and Dr. R. Hodes (NIH).

Isolation of CD4 Lymphocytes. Nylon wool (Robbins Scientific Corp., Sunnyvale, CA) nonadherent lymphoid suspensions were incubated with 3-1.5.5, 10-2.16, Y-17, J11d.2, SW3A4, DNase, and Low-Tox-M rabbit C<sub>3</sub> (Cedarlane Laboratories Limited, Hornby, Ontario, Canada) and centrifuged over Lymphocyte-M (Cedarlane). Viable cells were stained with allophycocyanin-GK1.5 (αCD8), PE-IM7.8.1 (αCD44), and FITC-RR-A4-7 (αV/β) or R88-1 (αV/β)1 (Pharmingen) and sorted on the FACStar PLUS® (Becton Dickinson & Co., Mountain View, CA). Sorted cells were in some experiments dispensed at one cell per well using a FACStar® equipped with a FACStar® Automated Cell Deposition Unit (ACDU) (Becton Dickinson & Co., Mountain View, CA).

Isolation of Splenic B Cells. Sephadex G10 (Pharmacia LKB, Uppsala Sweden) nonadherent spleen cells were incubated with 3-1.5.5, RL172.4, J10-10, SW3A4, DNase, and guinea pig C<sub>3</sub> (CIBICO BRL, Gaithersburg, MD). Viable cells were collected over Lympholyte-M. For activation, cells were cultured in upright 25 cm<sup>2</sup> flasks (model 3050 Covaris, Cambridge, MA) for 24-60 h at 5 × 10<sup>5</sup>/ml with 10 μg/ml LPS B Escherichia coli 055:B5 (Difco Laboratories) or with 100 μg/ml poly I-poly C (Calbiochem-Novabiochem Corp., La Jolla, CA) in the absence or presence of 50 U/ml rIL-4. Purity of the resultant populations was determined by staining with FITC- or PE-B220 (αCD45R) (Pharmingen).

Isolation of Splenic Dendritic Cells. Splenic suspensions were incubated for 2 h in 5% CO<sub>2</sub> at 37°C on Falcon 3025 tissue culture plates (Becton Dickinson & Co., Cockeyesville, MD). Nonadherent cells were removed and plates were incubated for another 6-24 h. Viable cells that had detached were collected after centrifugation over Lympholyte-M. Low-density cells were further enriched by freeing with percollation over 50% Percoll (Pharmacia LKB, Piscataway, NJ). Purity of the resultant population was determined by staining with biotinylated 33D1 mAb followed by PE-streptavidin (Caltag Laboratories, South San Francisco, CA).

Limiting Dilution Analysis (LDA) of IL-2 Producers and APC. To determine IL-2 producer frequencies, CD4 T cells were titrated into 96-well round bottom plates (model 3799, Costar) with 20 replicate wells per cell density in the presence of excess peptide and APCs in a final volume of 50 μl. The APC frequency was determined by titrating APCs into wells containing nonlimiting numbers of CD4 T cells (i.e., 30-50). At least 72 h later, the plates were frozen, thawed, and supplemented with 10<sup>5</sup> CTL-L cells/well. After 16-24 h, the wells were pulsed with 1 μCi [<sup>3</sup>H]thymidine (6.7 Ci/mmol; ICN Radiochemicals, Irvine, CA) and harvested 8-16 h later using a Brandell Cell Harvester (Medical Research and Development, Gaithersburg, MD). Proliferation of CTL-L, measured as isotope incorporation into DNA, was quantified with an LKB Betaplate scintillation counter (Wallac, Gaithersburg, MD). Background counts were determined in wells lacking CD4 cells, peptide, or APCs. Although CTL-L cells also proliferate in response to high concentrations of IL-4, the addition of αIL-4 mAb had no effect, whereas the addition of αIL-2 mAb prevented CTL-L growth, indicating that the only lymphokine measured in these cultures was IL-2. IL-2 concentrations in individual wells were determined by comparing CTL-L growth in these wells with growth in wells containing known quantities of rIL-2. The standard curve was fit to a logit function using a Marquand nonlinear regression algorithm.

Results

CD4 T Cells Expressing Low Levels of CD44 as a Source of Naïve T Cells. Our first task was to identify and isolate naïve T cells. In immunized animals, CD44 is expressed at higher levels on primed T cells, which give detectable recall responses upon restimulation in vitro, than on naïve T cells, which do not respond (24, 25). B10.A mice were immunized...
with the pcc 81-104 peptide in CFA and tested after intervals of up to 3 mo. Lymph node and spleen cells were sorted for the expression of CD4 or additionally for the expression of Vα11 and various levels of CD44, the gates of which are shown in the inset to Fig. 1. IL-2-producing cells were detected among CD4 T cells taken from primed animals. Frequencies of 1/20 to 1/40 were observed with Vα11+ CD44high responders. In contrast, Vα11+ cells expressing low or medium levels of CD44 contributed very little to the response. It should be noted that the frequency of responding cells was similar for unseparated CD4 T cells and for those further enriched in Vα11+, CD44med cells. Since CD4 T cells bearing Vα11-containing TCRs account for most of the response to the 81-104 fragment in B10.A mice (26) and represent 5% of the CD4 population (data not shown), we would have expected at least a 20-fold higher frequency among the CD44low or CD44med subsets if they were involved in the response. Therefore, the low frequencies observed in these subsets reflect either a small role for such cells in memory responses or a small contamination with CD44high CD4 T cells. Similar results were observed in three independent experiments. Thus, most memory cells maintain high CD44 expression for long periods and would therefore be excluded from populations of naive cells selected by their CD44low phenotype in young adult mice.

**CD28 Ligation Costimulates IL-2 Production by Naive CD4 T Cells.** Memory CD4 Th1 clones fail to proliferate or produce IL-2 when triggered through their TCRs in the absence of costimulatory signals (27). Ligation of the CD28 molecule on the T cell suffices to costimulate IL-2 production and clonal expansion (28–30). To determine whether CD28 ligation could similarly costimulate naive T cells, we used CD4 T cells from animals transgenic for a TCR that recognizes the pcc 81-104 peptide presented by I-Ek. In transgenic mice of the appropriate MHC background, most of the peripheral T cells express the Vα11 transgene and CD4 (31) as well as low or medium levels of CD44; most CD44high CD4 T cells do not express high levels of the Vα11 transgene (data not shown). To engage the TCR under noncostimulatory conditions, paraformaldehyde-fixed I-Ek+ spleen cells were used to present the 81-104 peptide (27). Peripheral Vα11+ CD44low CD4 T cells produced IL-2 in response to peptide presented by irradiated splenic APCs as seen in Table 1, Expt. 1. Occasionally, the frequency of IL-2 producers was as high as 1/1. More typically the frequency was 1/2 to 1/5. In contrast, fixed spleen cells were unable to stimulate the CD4 T cells (frequency <1/20). IL-2 production could be restored, however, by the addition of αCD28 mAb. Similar results were observed in each of seven experiments. These data indicate that peptide-pulsed, fixed APCs are capable of triggering the TCR and that ligation of CD28 on naive CD4 T cells overcomes the costimulatory defect of fixed APCs.

**Optimal Activation of Naive CD4 T Cells Requires Interaction with a CTLA-4 Binding Ligand on APCs.** Costimulatory signals are delivered to T cells as a result of interactions between CD28 receptors on T cells and B7-1 and B7-2 ligands on APCs (29, 32). These ligands bind to CD28 (33) and more efficiently to CTLA-4, a receptor expressed on activated T cells (34, 35). We have used the solubilized receptor CTLA4Ig to determine whether costimulation of naive CD4 T cells involves a CTLA-4–reactive ligand(s) on APCs. Splenic APCs in the presence of the 81-104 peptide induced a high frequency of CD44low transgenic CD4 T cells to produce IL-2 (Table 1, Expt. 1). In this and two additional experiments, the presence of the CTLA4Ig fusion protein reduced the responder frequency an average of 4.1-fold (×/× 1.2). This effect was

### Table 1. Role of CTLA-4–reactive Ligands and CD28 in Activation of Naive CD4 T Cells

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Expt</th>
<th>APC</th>
<th>CTLA4Ig</th>
<th>αCD28</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Irr</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>4.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fix</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Irr</td>
<td>No</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>6.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Irr</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>1.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reciprocal responder frequencies and 95% confidence intervals are shown as determined in the presence of 10 μM 81-104 and 2 × 10^5 rad irradiated (ir) or paraformaldehyde-treated (Fix) T-depleted B10.A spleen cells in the absence or presence of 10 μg/ml mCTLA4Ig or αCD28 mAb (1:5,000 of ascites).
not observed with L6Ig, an irrelevant fusion protein of similar construction (36, and data not shown). Direct ligation of CD28 with cCD28 mAb overcame the inhibition seen with CTLA4Ig, restoring a high frequency of responding T cells. Thus, naive CD T cells become optimally activated only if their costimulatory receptor(s) engage a CTLA-4-reactive ligand. The failure to achieve >75% reduction in responding T cells even with saturating concentrations of mCTLA4Ig (10 µg/ml) raises the possibility that costimulatory molecules, in addition to those that bind CTLA-4, may participate in the activation of naive T cells.

Dendritic Cells and Activated B Cells as APCs for Naive CD4 T Cells. Because costimulation of IL-2 production by naive CD4 T cells depends on interactions with CTLA-4-reactive ligands on APCs and can be induced by CD28 ligation, one might predict that as long as an APC expressed the B7-1 or B7-2 ligands in addition to the appropriate peptide–MHC complex and adhesion molecules, it should be competent to activate naive T cells. Splenic dendritic cells isolated by adherence express one or more CTLA-4-reactive ligands, high levels of MHC class II molecules, and have been reported to be potent APCs for primary T cell responses (1, 2, 37). Activated B cells upregulate expression of B7-1 and B7-2, which confer comparable costimulatory function when transfected into COS cells (32). Therefore, both these types of APCs would be expected to stimulate naive CD4 T cells. Dendritic cells have been demonstrated, however, to be 10–30-fold more efficient than activated B cells as APCs (1), raising the possibility that previous reports attributing stimulatory function to B cell blasts actually reflect the APC function of contaminating dendritic cells in the B cell preparations. Therefore, to more definitively address the question of whether activated B cells can stimulate naive CD4 T cells, we cocultured the cells under conditions of limiting dilution. First, to be certain that any detected response was due to stimulation of naive CD4 T cells and not to potential memory T cell contaminants, we titrated CD44<sup>+</sup> transgenic CD4 T cells into wells containing excess peptide and APC (Fig. 2). A high frequency of IL-2 producers was detected in cultures containing excess peptide and APC (Fig. 2). Activated B cells stimulated the CD4 T cells. As shown in Fig. 3 A, the frequency of cells in the dendritic cell population capable of inducing IL-2 production by naive CD4 T cells was eightfold higher than the frequency of such APCs in the LPS-activated B cell preparation. The relative difference in APC frequency between these two cell types varied from 3-10-fold in several experiments, whether the B cells were activated with LPS, poly I:C, or

![Figure 2. Activated B cells stimulate IL-2 production by naive CD4 T cells. CD44<sup>+</sup> Vα11<sup>+</sup> transgenic CD4 T cells were titrated into wells containing 1 µM 81-104 and either 50 dendritic cells (O) or 500 LPS-activated B cells (A) from B10.A mice. The responder frequencies were: 1/3.1 (2.2-3.9) (O) and 1/2.1 (1.5-2.0) (A).](image1)

![Figure 3. Frequencies of dendritic cells and activated B cells that stimulate IL-2 production by naive CD4 T cells. (A) Splenic dendritic cells (O) or LPS-activated B cells (A) from B10.A mice were titrated into wells containing 1 µM 81-104 and 30 CD44<sup>low</sup> Vα11<sup>+</sup> transgenic CD4 T cells from nontransgenic B10.A mice (data not shown). Careful quantitative analysis of 21 peptide presentation experiments indicated that B cell blasts actually reflect the APC function of contaminating dendritic cells in the B cell preparations. Therefore, to more definitively address the question of whether activated B cells can stimulate naive CD4 T cells, we cocultured the cells under conditions of limiting dilution. First, to be certain that any detected response was due to stimulation of naive CD4 T cells and not to potential memory T cell contaminants, we titrated CD44<sup>+</sup> transgenic CD4 T cells into wells containing excess peptide and APC (Fig. 2). A high frequency of IL-2 producers was detected in cultures containing excess peptide and APC (Fig. 2). Activated B cells stimulated the CD4 T cells. As shown in Fig. 3 A, the frequency of cells in the dendritic cell population capable of inducing IL-2 production by naive CD4 T cells was eightfold higher than the frequency of such APCs in the LPS-activated B cell preparation. The relative difference in APC frequency between these two cell types varied from 3-10-fold in several experiments, whether the B cells were activated with LPS, poly I:C, or
been demonstrated to be inferior to dendritic cells in stimulating freshly isolated naive CD4 T cells to produce IL-2.

The observation that dendritic cells stimulated at all could result from contaminating activated B cells as our dendritic cell preparations routinely contained 10–20% B220+ cells. We showed above, however, that the inferiority is evident even when the frequency of responding T cells was examined in the presence of excess presenting cells. Another possibility is that the potency of the cells within the stimulatory subsets of the two populations differed and determined the extent to which each T cell was stimulated. To examine this question, individual CD4 T cells were dispensed into wells containing excess peptide and either dendritic or activated B cells. The amount of IL-2 produced by each CD4 T cell was quantified and is presented in Fig. 4. In this experiment, the average amount of IL-2 produced by B cell–stimulated, responding CD4 T cells (0.0037 ± 1.13 U/cell) was 4.5-fold less than that produced by CD4 T cells stimulated with dendritic cells (0.0166 ± 1.23 U/cell). In four similar experiments, dendritic cells induced, on average, 3.70 ± 1.13-fold greater IL-2 production than did activated B cells (p < 0.001).

To explore whether this difference had a trivial explanation, we first considered the possibility that the B cell blasts did not stimulate the T cells at all, but instead produced the IL-2 themselves. Freshly isolated lymph node B cells have been shown to express IL-2 mRNA (41). Similarly, splenic B cells stimulated in vitro secrete IL-2. Concentrations of FCS >2%, however, block this activity of B cells (42). Our experiments (data not shown). Finally, activated B cells may produce factors that are toxic either to the responding CD4 T cells or the indicator CTL-L cells. To address this possibility, single CD4 T cells were deposited in wells containing either dendritic cells or B cell blasts alone or in combination. As shown in Fig. 4 C, the amount of IL-2 detected in wells containing the mixture of APC (0.0218 ± 1.21 U/ml) was not significantly different from that detected in wells with dendritic cell APC alone and was significantly higher than in wells with B cell APC alone (see above). Thus, activated B cells neither consumed appreciable quantities of IL-2 nor interfered with the activation of naive CD4 T cells by dendritic cells. We therefore conclude that even within the stimulatory subset, activated B cells are not as potent as dendritic cells in eliciting IL-2 production by naive CD4 T cells.

Failure to Detect Stimulatory Capacity from Every APC. The APC frequency detected among dendritic cell preparations in 27 experiments was on average 1/5.80 (±1.09), and similar even when the cells were sorted for 33D1 expression (data not shown). A frequency of less than 1/1 might indicate that only a fraction of the cells provided both TCR occupancy and costimulatory signals. Because optimal IL-2

anti-Ig (data not shown). Nonetheless, the B cell preparations were typically >97% B220+ and were not contaminated with 33D1+ cells (data not shown). Therefore, the stimulatory function detected in populations of activated B cells could not be readily attributed to contaminating non-B cells. To further establish this point, activated Mls-1+–expressing B cells were used to stimulate IL-2 production by CD44low V6+ CD4 T cells from nontransgenic mice (Fig. 3 B). In this case, the expression of the TCR ligand is largely confined to B cells and CD8 T cells (38–40), which probably accounts for the low APC frequency detected among dendritic cells. The observation that dendritic cells stimulated at all could result from contaminating activated B cells as our dendritic cell preparations routinely contained 10–20% B220+ cells. Thus, these results indicate that activated B cells can stimulate naive CD4 T cells to produce IL-2.
production required 72 h of culture, during which time there was extensive cell death among the APCs (data not shown), it is also possible that not all of the cells survived long enough to impart the necessary signals to the T cells. This possibility was explored by supplementing the cultures with trophic factors and determining the resultant effect on the detected APC frequencies. GM-CSF promotes survival of cultured murine epidermal Langerhans cells (45). Similarly, IL-4 improves viability of B cells stimulated with anti-IgM (46). Neither GM-CSF nor IL-4 alone had any costimulatory activity on freshly isolated naive CD4 T cells (data not shown). As seen in Fig. 5 A, ~15% of the dendritic cells exhibited detectable APC function. Addition of IL-4 to the cultures increased this frequency only twofold. Supplementing the wells with GM-CSF, however, resulted in a 5.5-fold higher APC frequency; i.e., all the dendritic cells became capable of eliciting IL-2. This finding has been observed in five of six experiments with an average increase of 2.88 (×/± 1.23)-fold in the APC frequency. In parallel experiments, GM-CSF did not consistently affect APC frequencies in activated B cell preparations (Fig. 5 B). By contrast, in each of five trials, the presence of IL-4 in the cultures augmented activity of the B cells, with an average increase in the APC frequency of 4.33 (×/± 1.18)-fold. These results indicate that, depending on the conditions of culture, the calculated frequency of cells capable of stimulating naive CD4 T cells can be considerably underestimated. Moreover, the extent of underestimation could be greater for the population of activated B cells than for dendritic cells, because activated B cells exhibited poorer viability in culture (data not shown). Thus, it was possible that poorer survival of B cell blasts accounted for their inferior stimulation of IL-2 production by individual T cells (Fig. 4).

Figure 5. Lymphokines augment APC frequencies. Dendritic cells (A) or poly I:C-activated B cells (B) from B10.A mice were titrated into wells containing 50 CD44low Vα11+ transgenic CD4 T cells and 10 μM 81-104 in the absence (O) or presence of 10 ng/ml rmGM-CSF (A) or 50 U/ml rIL-4 (□). APC frequencies were: (A) 1/6.6 (5.0-7.8) (O), 1/1.2 (0.9-1.5) (A), 1/3.6 (2.7-4.3) (□); and (B) 1/122.5 (91.7-147.8) (O), 1/152 (115-182) (A), 1/16.8 (14.4-18.3) (□).

Figure 6. CD28 ligation overcomes deficient APC function of B cell blasts. Individual CD44low Vα11+ CD4 cells were dispensed into wells containing 10 μM 81-104 and 10^9 B10.A dendritic cells (A) or 5 × 10^6 poly I:C-activated B cells in the absence (B) or presence of αCD28 mAb (C) or 50 U/ml IL-4 (D). Data are presented as in Fig. 4.
possible that activated B cells are relatively inefficient at costimulatory ligands. Incomplete CTLA4Ig-mediated blocking of dendritic cell-stimulated primary alloresponses was similarly observed by Lenshow et al. (47). Therefore, it is possible that activated B cells possess alternative costimulatory ligands. Incomplete CTLA4Ig-mediated blocking of dendritic cell–stimulated primary alloresponses was similarly observed by Lenshow et al. (47). Therefore, it is possible that activated B cells are relatively inefficient at stimulating IL-2 production because they do not express sufficient levels of all the costimulatory molecules necessary for optimal activation of naïve CD4 T cells.

To test this possibility, the ability of activated B cells to stimulate naïve CD4 T cells was determined in the presence or absence of αCD28 mAb (Table 2). In the presence of αCD28, activated B cells exhibited a much higher APC frequency for peptide presentation than in the absence of the mAb. An augmented APC frequency in the presence of αCD28 mAb was also detected for activated B cells presenting Mls-1+ to V86+ CD4 T cells (data not shown). These findings indicate that the low frequency of APC within a population of activated B cells is due in part to a low frequency of cells with sufficient costimulatory function to activate naïve CD4 T cells.

We also examined the amount of IL-2 produced by individual CD4 T cells stimulated by activated B cells in the absence or presence of αCD28 mAb. The addition of αCD28 mAb to the cultures containing B cells resulted in the production of larger quantities of IL-2 (mean = 0.0012 x/+ 1.12 U/cell, Fig. 6 C) compared with 0.00052 x/+ 1.16 U/cell, Fig. 6 B), as high as those obtained in wells containing dendritic cells (mean = 0.0011 x/+ 1.19 U/ml, Fig. 6 A). This is one of seven similar experiments. Thus, the subset of activated B cells that can stimulate CD4 T cells does so less efficiently than dendritic cells, at least in part because of a deficiency in costimulation.

We next asked whether, in addition to being deficient in their ability to costimulate, activated B cells also provided suboptimal stimulation through the TCR. The expression of adhesion molecules is critical for optimal TCR-mediated activation (48, 49). Resting B cells express low levels of these molecules and have been characterized as having minimal APC function for unprimed T cells (37). In contrast, both dendritic cells and activated B cell express higher levels of adhesion molecules such as LFA-1 and ICAM-1, although the levels on activated B cells in our experiments were consistently two- to threefold lower than on dendritic cells (Fig. 8, B and C). Expression of L-EY, the presenting element for the 81-104 peptide, was roughly equivalent on both cell types as shown in Fig. 8 A, and higher than the low levels reported on resting B cells (1). To examine the relative ability to engage the TCR, we compared the APC frequencies of dendritic cells and activated B cells at decreasing concentrations of the 81-104 peptide. αCD28 was included in the wells with B cells to ensure that costimulation was not limiting in these cultures. The results shown in Table 2 indicate that peptide became limiting for optimal antigen presentation at a threefold lower concentration for dendritic cells than for activated B cells in one experiment, and at the same concentration in a second experiment. By contrast, the ability of resting B cells to stimulate CD4 T cells was always more sensitive to decreases in peptide concentration (Table 2 and data not shown). We interpret these data to indicate that activated B cells are slightly deficient in expressing the required combination of adhesion molecules and peptide–MHC complexes to sufficiently engage the TCR and initiate the signal 1 pathway.
Figure 8. Relative expression of adhesion molecules. Dendritic cells ( ) and poly I:C-activated B cells (---) were incubated with 2.4G2 followed by FITC-conjugated antibodies to I-E, LFA-1, and ICAM-1.

Discussion

Our understanding of the roles played by various APC in stimulating T cell immunity remains incomplete. Cells of the Langerhans/dendritic cell lineage take up, process, and present soluble protein (50-53) and have been implicated in the initial capture of antigen and presentation of antigen-derived peptides (54). Moreover, because dendritic cells stimulate freshly explanted T cells from unmanipulated animals more efficiently than do B cells or macrophages (1, 55), the idea that dendritic cells are the initiating APC in immune responses has gained acceptance (15, 17).

There are conflicting reports concerning the ability of activated B cells to stimulate naive T cells. In support of such a role, optimal T cell priming was found to require B cells. Thus, lymph node T cells from B cell-depleted mice injected with protein antigen in CFA proliferated poorly when challenged with antigen in vitro (12–16). T cell priming did occur, however, when haptenated antigen in CFA was administered together with hapten-primed B cells (15). Lin et al. (17) have proposed a model in which dendritic cells prime the first cohort of native T cells, which then provide help for activation of B cells. Once activated, the B cells can then directly prime additional naive T cells (16, 17). In this report, however, it was not shown that activated B cells directly stimulated naive T cells. Instead, the activated B cells may have produced antibody that formed complexes with the antigen, and the initiating APC may have been a non-B cell capable of taking up the complexes and presenting antigenic fragments (10).

There are two recent reports that contradict the notion that activated B cells stimulate naive T cells. In the first case, Fuchs and Matzinger (22) demonstrated that injection into naive mice of activated B cells, unlike unfractionated spleen cells, failed to prime and instead tolerated CD8 CTL precursors (CTLp) specific for the H-Y antigen expressed by the injected cells. In the second study, Ronchese and Hausmann (21) transferred HSA<sup>+</sup> thymocytes into SCID mice either alone or with antigen-primed B cells. Injection of antigen into both sets of reconstituted recipients primed only those T cells restricted to the MHC of the non-B APC. The authors interpreted these results to mean that activated B cells could not stimulate naive T cells (21).

Given the controversy with in vivo experiments and the failure of in vitro studies to demonstrate beyond doubt that activated B cells, rather than non-B contaminants, stimulate naive T cells, we decided to reexamine this question. As a convenient source of naive T cells, we used CD4<sup>+</sup> V<sup>α</sup>11<sup>+</sup> cells from TCR transgenic mice. To assure ourselves that the activated B cells to stimulate unprimed T cells. In support of such a role, optimal T cell priming was found to require B cells. Thus, lymph node T cells from B cell-depleted mice injected with protein antigen in CFA proliferated poorly when challenged with antigen in vitro (12–16). T cell priming did occur, however, when haptenated antigen in CFA was administered together with hapten-primed B cells (15). Lin et al. (17) have proposed a model in which dendritic cells prime the first cohort of native T cells, which then provide help for activation of B cells. Once activated, the B cells can then directly prime additional naive T cells (16, 17). In this report, however, it was not shown that activated B cells directly stimulated naive T cells. Instead, the activated B cells may have produced antibody that formed complexes with the antigen, and the initiating APC may have been a non-B cell capable of taking up the complexes and presenting antigenic fragments (10).

There are two recent reports that contradict the notion that activated B cells stimulate naive T cells. In the first case, Fuchs and Matzinger (22) demonstrated that injection into naive mice of activated B cells, unlike unfractionated spleen cells, failed to prime and instead tolerated CD8 CTL precursors (CTLp) specific for the H-Y antigen expressed by the injected cells. In the second study, Ronchese and Hausmann (21) transferred HSA<sup>+</sup> thymocytes into SCID mice either alone or with antigen-primed B cells. Injection of antigen into both sets of reconstituted recipients primed only those T cells restricted to the MHC of the non-B APC. The authors interpreted these results to mean that activated B cells could not stimulate naive T cells (21).

Given the controversy with in vivo experiments and the failure of in vitro studies to demonstrate beyond doubt that activated B cells, rather than non-B contaminants, stimulate naive T cells, we decided to reexamine this question. As a convenient source of naive T cells, we used CD4<sup>+</sup> V<sup>α</sup>11<sup>+</sup> cells from TCR transgenic mice. To assure ourselves that the activated B cells to stimulate unprimed T cells. In support of such a role, optimal T cell priming was found to require B cells. Thus, lymph node T cells from B cell-depleted mice injected with protein antigen in CFA proliferated poorly when challenged with antigen in vitro (12–16). T cell priming did occur, however, when haptenated antigen in CFA was administered together with hapten-primed B cells (15). Lin et al. (17) have proposed a model in which dendritic cells prime the first cohort of native T cells, which then provide help for activation of B cells. Once activated, the B cells can then directly prime additional naive T cells (16, 17). In this report, however, it was not shown that activated B cells directly stimulated naive T cells. Instead, the activated B cells may have produced antibody that formed complexes with the antigen, and the initiating APC may have been a non-B cell capable of taking up the complexes and presenting antigenic fragments (10).

There are two recent reports that contradict the notion that activated B cells stimulate naive T cells. In the first case, Fuchs and Matzinger (22) demonstrated that injection into naive mice of activated B cells, unlike unfractionated spleen cells, failed to prime and instead tolerated CD8 CTL precursors (CTLp) specific for the H-Y antigen expressed by the injected cells. In the second study, Ronchese and Hausmann (21) transferred HSA<sup>+</sup> thymocytes into SCID mice either alone or with antigen-primed B cells. Injection of antigen into both sets of reconstituted recipients primed only those T cells restricted to the MHC of the non-B APC. The authors interpreted these results to mean that activated B cells could not stimulate naive T cells (21).

Given the controversy with in vivo experiments and the failure of in vitro studies to demonstrate beyond doubt that activated B cells, rather than non-B contaminants, stimulate naive T cells, we decided to reexamine this question. As a convenient source of naive T cells, we used CD4<sup>+</sup> V<sup>α</sup>11<sup>+</sup> cells from TCR transgenic mice. To assure ourselves that the

Table 2. Relative Efficiency of Peptide Presentation by Different APCs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Expt.</th>
<th>(81-104)</th>
<th>PIC B*</th>
<th>PIC B plus αCD28</th>
<th>Dendritic cells</th>
<th>Dense B cells</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>47.4 (39.6–52.7)</td>
<td>9.3 (8.2–10.0)</td>
<td>6.8 (5.3–8.0)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>10.5 (8.9–11.6)</td>
<td>16.8 (13.1–19.6)</td>
<td>10.5 (7.9–12.6)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>31.0 (23.8–36.7)</td>
<td>27.8 (21.7–32.3)</td>
<td>378 (254–505)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>122 (92–148)</td>
<td>4.4 (3.3–5.3)</td>
<td>6.5 (5.2–7.5)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>8.0 (6.1–9.5)</td>
<td>5.6 (4.1–6.7)</td>
<td>10.5 (7.9–12.6)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.33</td>
<td>8.5 (6.7–9.8)</td>
<td>5.6 (4.4–6.5)</td>
<td>378 (254–505)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.11</td>
<td>13.5 (10.1–16.3)</td>
<td>9.1 (6.9–10.8)</td>
<td>14.5 (11.1–7.2)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.037</td>
<td>25.8 (19.1–31.3)</td>
<td>11.7 (8.7–14.2)</td>
<td>74.1 (55.4–9.5)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>0.012</td>
<td>66.7 (49.4–81.3)</td>
<td>25.9 (19.2–31.4)</td>
<td>74.1 (55.4–9.5)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reciprocal APC frequencies and 95% confidence intervals are shown as determined in the presence of CD44<sup>+</sup> transgenic CD4 T cells, the absence or presence of αCD28 mAb, and the indicated micromolar concentrations of peptide 81-104.

* Poly I:C-activated B cells.
activation requirements of these cells reflected those of naive cells developing in a normal animal, we included in our study Mls-reactive CD44low, Vβ6+ CD4 T cells isolated from nontransgenic mice. IL-2 production by these naive CD4 T cells required costimulatory signals that could be provided by CD28 ligation and that depended on interaction with CTLA-4-reactive ligands expressed by APC. Since both dendritic cells and B cell blasts express such ligands and since both B7-1 and B7-2 have costimulatory function (35, 56), both APC types were expected to stimulate naive CD4 T cells. Indeed, we found that the frequency of naive CD4 T cells capable of responding either to 81-104/Eκ or to Mls presented by activated B cells was high, although slightly lower than the frequency of naive T cells responding to 81-104/Eκ presented by dendritic cells. This was not evident from previous studies. Using primary MLR against alloantigens other than Mls, Metlay et al. (1) reported that 10-30 times higher numbers of B cell blasts were required to stimulate responses equivalent to those induced by dendritic cells. Our results in nonlymphokine-supplemented medium, where the APC survival is poor, confirm this finding. Metlay et al. (37) noted that the reduced potency of activated B cells could mean that B cell blasts are efficient APC only for a subset of T cells or that B cell blasts stimulate all T cells but only 3-10% as well as dendritic cells. A third possibility is that only a small subset of activated B cells has detectable APC function. Our results strongly support the second and third possibilities, and are compatible with a small contribution from the first. In addition, the frequency of B cells capable of eliciting IL-2 production by naive transgenic CD4 T cells was high enough, especially when cultured with IL-4, to rule out the possibility that the observed stimulating capacity was due to contaminating dendritic cells or any other non-B cell. Detection of a higher frequency of Mls-presenting APC among activated B cells than among dendritic cells provides particularly compelling evidence that B cells can stimulate naive CD4 T cells.

Because of poor cell survival in vitro, the stimulatory deficiency of activated B cells may not have been reliably indicated by the responder and APC frequencies we detected in the cultures. The single cell experiments, however, revealed that the extent to which T cells were activated to produce IL-2 was fourfold lower after stimulation with B cell blasts than with dendritic cells. Metlay et al. (37) hold the view that the relative inability of B cell blasts to form aggregates with T cells accounts for the inferior stimulatory function of activated B cells. These investigators have documented a role for LFA-1 in the antigen-dependent interaction between T cells and both APC types (55), and suggest that dendritic cells, but not B blasts, have additional clustering capabilities that are independent of LFA-1 and antigen (37). We found that B cell blasts expressed slightly lower levels of LFA-1 and ICAM-1 and that their APC function was, in some cases, more sensitive to decreases in peptide concentration than was seen with dendritic cells. Although our data as well as that of Jenkins et al. (57) indicate that potential differences in LFA-1-dependent T-APC interactions do not always exert a detectable effect on TCR occupancy for either naive or memory T cells, it is possible that the superior clustering function of dendritic cells serves to facilitate delivery of costimulatory signals. Consistent with this, we found with nonlimiting peptide concentrations that the relative stimulatory deficiency of the B cells was overcome by directly ligating the CD28 molecule on the CD4 T cell. Thus, activated B cells are also poorer APC because they fail to provide adequate costimulatory signals to naive CD4 T cells. This costimulatory deficiency of activated B cells has recently been observed for stimulation of certain Th1 clones as well (58).

Our studies show that naive peripheral CD4 T cells stimulated by B cell blasts produce only 25% the amount of IL-2 elicited by dendritic cells. This observation might help to reconcile some of the conflicting reports in the literature. In the experiments of Lin et al. (17), where activated B cells are thought to play a role in T cell priming, the antigen was administered in CPA. This may have eliminated the costimulatory deficiency of the primed B cells and allowed them to present antigen to naive T cells. In the SCID reconstitution experiments of Ronchese and Hausmann (21), it was noted that T cells restricted to the MHC of cotransferred B cells were primed when splenic rather than thymic CD4 T cells were transferred into the mice. The authors believe this was due to contaminating antigen-experienced T cells in the transferred splenic populations. Another possibility, however, is that the inferiority of activated B cells may be more pronounced with thymocytes than it is with naive peripheral T cells. In the study of Fuchs and Matzinger, (22) H-Y specific CTLp were tolerized after recognition of antigen on activated B cells. CTL priming often requires activation of CD4 T cells to produce IL-2 and perhaps other factors as well (59-62), in the absence of which the CTL become tolerized (63, 64). In preliminary experiments, the frequency of IL-2 producers detected in H-Y tolerant animals was higher than that seen in unprimed mice, but two- to threefold lower than that seen in primed animals (Schwartz, R. H. and C. Chen, unpublished observations). This suggests that the CD4 population was affected. It is not known how much IL-2 a CD4 T cell must produce either to support its own clonal expansion or to provide help in the activation of other T cells. Whether a fourfold reduction in lymphokine production is large enough to account for the CTL tolerance or lack of thymocyte priming reported in vivo is unclear. A three- to fourfold difference in production in vivo of other Th1 lymphokines, however, is associated with a dramatic physiologic difference in susceptibility to certain bacterial infections (65).

The major finding of the current study is that, in spite of their high levels of CTLA-4/CD28-reactive ligands, activated B cells are quantitatively deficient in providing costimulatory signals necessary for IL-2 production by naive CD4 T cells. To some extent, the costimulatory ligands involved in the APC function of both dendritic cells and activated B cells appear to be similar since CTLA4Ig impaired stimulation of T cells in response to either APC. The relative roles of the currently known murine CTLA-4 ligands, B7-1 and B7-2, on the two APC types is not entirely clear. B7-1 has been
Activated B cells express relatively low levels or B7-1 and B7-2 (48, 67). mAb also fails to fully block cytokine production by B cell blasts. Murine splenic dendritic cells and cultured Langerhans cells have been shown to transcribe and express B7-1 (48, 67). mAb does not effectively block their APC function (35). It is interesting to note that we have found, in preliminary experiments, that whereas αB7-2 mAb readily blocks IL-2 production by naive CD4 T cells induced by activated B cells, it has no effect on the response elicited by dendritic cells (our unpublished observations). Because dendritic cell-induced IL-2 production is incompletely blocked by CTLA4Ig, αB7-1, and αB7-2 mAb, there may be as yet undefined costimulatory ligands important to the unique function of these cells.


